



RRPE89030034 (Σ.P)

## 行政院國家科學委員會專題研究計劃成果報告

《死者曆書》的「(反)文化書寫」:

文學與人類學之可譯性探討

"Writing against Culture" in *The Almanac of the Dead*:

A Study of the Translatability between Literature and Anthropology

計劃編號: NSC89-2411-H-032-B9

計劃期限: 88年8月1日至89年7月31日

計劃主持人: 梁一萍

師範大學英語系

## 一 中文摘要

本計劃專注於萊絲莉·摩門·席爾珂(Leslie Marmon Silko)小說《死者曆書》(*The Almanac of the Dead: A Novel*, 1991), 將其放在白人人類學民族誌書寫與原住民文學「(反)文化書寫」交叉點上; 理論中心在模倣(mimesis), 引用班雅明(Walter Benjamin)翻譯觀, 從模倣思辯翻譯, 企圖開放原本(idea/origin)與影本(imitation/copy), 從中探討書寫(writing)在文學與人類學學科建構中的功能角色, 進而說明伊哲(Wolfgang Iser)文學人類學的意義, 及其與北美洲原住民文學的理論關係。

## 關鍵詞

席爾珂、《死者曆書》、原住民文學、克魯佩特、書寫、班雅明、模倣、文學人類學、民族誌、克里佛德、阿布·露拘、伊哲

## 英文摘要

This study focuses on Leslie Marmon Silko's *The Almanac of the Dead: A Novel* (1991), which is theorized at the intersection of the anthropological tradition of "writing culture" in ethnography and the tribal resistance of "writing against culture" in native literature. Theoretically it centers on the

concept of mimesis by incorporating Walter Benjamin's ideas of translation and the similar. By opening the dialectics between idea/origin and imitation/copy, it attempts to re-configure translation and to place writing within the fields of literature and anthropology. Moreover, it intends to explicate Wolfgang Iser's theory of literary anthropology and its theoretical relationships with the native literature of North America.

## Key Words

Silko, *Almanac of the Dead*, Native American Literature, Writing, Iser, Benjamin, Literary Anthropology, Ethnography, Clifford, Abu-Lughod, Krupat

## 二 源由與目的

本計劃源起筆者一九九八年參與國際人文理論學校(International School of Theory in the Humanities)於西班牙聖地牙哥大學舉辦的暑期課程, 受教於伊哲、史瓦柏(Gabriele Schwab)與史百瑞蘇(Mihai Spariosu)等學者, 因對文學與人類學之相互轉向有所啟發與興趣。

本計劃以模倣為理論中心, 將原本/影本二元結構視為西方論述基本之一, 將翻譯視為流動其間的辯證歷程, 以動態模倣稱之, 企圖以此模式討論文

化翻譯、人類學的「文化書寫」與原住民文學的「反文化書寫」。

### 三 結果與討論

本計劃對西方論述八十年代以來的文學與人類學相互轉向提出新的研究方向。國外學者大多專注於文學與民族誌書寫之相通性(compatibility)，討論以文類(genre)為主(Atkinson 1990; Benson 1993)；擴及文化政治(Clifford 1986; Daniel and Peck 1996)。本計劃側重書寫在文學與人類學學科領域之工具性(instrumentality)，其巧妙之處在將文學與人類學放在 mimesis 之原本／影本二元架構之內，前者以克里佛德為代表，後者以席爾珂為代表，由人類學的「文化書寫」轉向原住民文學的「反文化書寫」，以動態模倣(即翻譯)中介其中，以鬆動原本／影本二元架構。因此本計劃不再拘於文類討論，而以跨學科文化書寫的角度重新思考文學與人類學的書寫政治，企圖以上述理論研讀席爾珂小說《死者曆書》。另一方面，以伊哲的文學人類學為文學的人類學轉向，將虛構視為動態模倣，循此說明《死者曆書》為席爾珂對白人文化的詮釋(控訴)。

對席爾珂(Leslie Marmon Silko)的研究而言，本文上承《儀式》(Ceremony, 1977)下續《沙丘花園》(Gardens in the Dunes, 2000)，指出《死者曆書》與《摯愛》和《金山勇士》的關聯，對族群文學中的鬼魅(ghost)與律法(laws)研究更進一步。以主題而言，「死者」乃指北美洲原住民大屠殺中喪生的無數鬼魂，「曆書」乃指古代瑪雅曆書，經席爾珂翻譯成曆書小說，以「反小說」形式反抗文學典律。引用克魯佩特「反帝國翻譯」、妮嚷加娜「再翻譯」與阿布·露拘「反文化」等概念，以「反文化書寫」抗衡人類學的「文化書寫」，因此「反

文化書寫」可視為民族誌的小說化。以此而論，「死者」為紀念，「曆書」為諷擬，兩者皆對主流文學文化提出異議。

簡言之，本計劃對西方八十年以後的文學與人類學交鋒論戰，以翻譯角度重新整理，將翻譯定義為原本與影本之間的流動，以動態模倣稱之，不以原本為尊，但重翻譯歷程，並以此模式討論席爾珂小說《死者曆書》之「反文化書寫」。本計劃因對北美洲原住民文學之地理書寫、邊界敘事與預言文類有所觸及，對文獻資料運用恰當，對席爾珂研究更上層樓。

### 四 成果自評

本計劃相當艱難：第一、文學與人類學相關文獻多如過江之卿，執行期間花費相當時間吸收消化相關資料，仍然捉襟見肘；又因對人類學涉獵初淺，實在不敢奢言科際整合，但對文學與人類學交鋒之背景與西方人文學科之困境有所了解與體會。第二、從模倣角度整合理論，深思狂行，以吾淺見，可行也，但理論轉折宜更精細。第三、北美洲原住民文學的翻譯是相當重要的議題，但執行期間未能鑽研，只以克魯佩特做為代表，有待他日再作探討。最後、本文宜對維克多·特納(Victor Turner)再加筆墨，他在文學與人類學論戰中的先行位置宜再細究；此外，並可比較伊哲和葛茨，此二人可視為詮釋學傳統的文學與人類學學科分支。

綜言之，本計劃對筆者意義特別：閱畢七百餘頁《死者曆書》有如打通任督二脈，對席爾珂說故事本領更加折服；對哥倫布發現新大陸的譬喻(trope)更思鑽研；對北美洲原住民文學的反發現(反抗哥倫布發現新大陸)研究興趣更深；對美墨邊界敘事更有體會(相對於

奇哥娜邊界敘事，《死者曆書》是原住民邊界敘事)；對模倣理論與文學學科更有了解；《死者曆書》將南美、北美與非洲共治一爐，對業已冒現的「半球文學」(hemisphere literature) 驅勢有畫龍點睛之效。最後，人類學與地理學可說是帝國主義的雙生兄弟，因之對所謂的「西方」更加了解。

此外，伊哲讓我對詮釋學小有涉獵，但事實上，伊哲回到人類學論述不能不說保守，其理論遵循人本主義，和傅柯和薩伊德大異其趣。史百瑞蘇對模倣用功之深，令人折服，也因之讓我對希羅文哲更有了解。而史瓦柏以心理分析角度再訪民族誌，也令人可期。

本計劃成果分別以中文發表於師大英語系「翻譯、文學研究與文化翻譯」研討會(5/27/2000)；英文研討會論文發表於英國伯明罕大學舉辦之第三屆十字路口文化研究國際學術會議(6/22/2000)；修訂中文期刊論文刊登於《中外文學》2000年十月號。

##### 五、參考文獻

- Abu-Lughod, Lila. "Writing Against Culture." Fox 137-162.
- Asad, Talal. "The Concept of Cultural Translation in British Social Anthropology." Clifford and Marcus 141-164.
- Atkinson, Paul. *The Ethnographic Imagination: Textual Constructions of Reality*. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Benjamin, Walter. "The Storyteller" and "The Task of the Translator." *Illuminations*. Ed. Hannah Arendt. Trans. Harry Zohn. New York: Schocken, 1969. 83-111; 69-82.
- . "Doctrine of the Similar." Trans. Knut Tarnowski. *New German Critique* 17 (Spring, 1979), 65-69.
- Benson, Paul. Ed. *Anthropology and Literature*. Urbana: U of Illinois P, 1993.
- Boon, James. *From Symbolism to Structuralism: Levi-Strauss in a Literary Tradition*. New York: Harper & Row, 1972.
- Brown, Dee. *Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee: An Indian History of the American West*. New York: Bantam, 1972.
- Bruner, Edward. "Introduction: The Ethnographic Self and the Personal Self." *Anthropology and Literature*. Ed. Paul Benson. Chicago: U of Illinois P, 1993. 1-26.
- Clair, Janet. "Death of Love/Love of Death: Leslie Marmon Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *MELUS* 21.2 (1996): 21-33.
- Clifford, James and George Marcus, Eds. *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1986.
- Fox, Richard. *Recapturing Anthropology: Working in the Present*. Santa Fe, New Mexico: School of American Research Press, 1991.
- Geertz, Clifford. *Works and Lives: The Anthropologist as Author*. Oxford: Polity, 1988.
- . *Local Knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretive Anthropology*. New York: Basic Books, 1983.
- Harjo, Joy and Gloria Bird. *Reinventing the Enemy's Language: Contemporary Native Women's Writings of North America*. New York: Norton, 1997.
- Horvitz, Debora. "Freud, Marx and Chiapas in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *SAIL* 10.3 (Fall 1998): 47-63.
- Iser, Wolfgang. *The Fictive and The Imaginary: Charting Literary Anthropology*. Baltimore: Johns

- Hopkins, 1993.
- . *Prospecting: From Reader Response to Literary Anthropology*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins, 1989.
- . "Spenser's Arcadia: The Interrelation of Fiction and History." *Spariosu* 109-140.
- Krupat, Arnold. "Postcolonialism, Ideology, and Native American Literature." *The Turn to the Natives: Studies in Criticism and Culture*. Lincoln: U of Nebraska P, 1996. 30-55.
- . "On the Translation of Native American Literature: A Theorized History." *On the Translation of Native American Literature*. Ed. Brian Swann. Washington DC: Smithsonian Institution P, 1992.
- Niranjana, Tejaswini. *Siting Translation: History, Post-Structuralism, and the Colonial Context*. Berkeley: U of California P, 1992.
- Okely, James and H. Callaway. Eds. *Anthropology and Autobiography*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Olmsted, Jane. "The Uses of Blood in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *Contemporary Literature* 16.3 (1999): 464-90.
- Ong, Walter. *Orality and Literacy: The Technologizing of the Word*. New York: Routledge, 1982.
- Reineke, Yvonne. "Overturning the (New World) Order: Of Space, Time, and Writing and Prophecy in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *SAIL* 10.3 (Fall 1998): 65-83.
- Richards, David. *Masks of Difference: Cultural Representation in Literature, Anthropology and Art*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1994.
- Salyer, Gregory. *Leslie Marmon Silko*. New York: Twayne, 1997
- Silko, Leslie Marmon. *Gardens in the Dunes*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 2000.
- . *Yellow Woman and a Beauty of Spirit: Essays on Native American Life Today*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1996.
- . "Landscape, History, and the Pueblo Imagination." *Celebrating the Land: Women's Nature Writings, 1850-1991*. Ed. Karen Knowles. Cadillac: Northland Publishing, 1992.
- . *The Almanac of the Dead*. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1991.
- . *Storyteller*. New York: Arcade, 1981.
- . *Ceremony*. (1977). New York: Penquin, 1986.
- Spariosu, Mihai. *The Wreath of Wild Olive: Play, Liminality, and the Study Of Literature*. Albany: SUNY, 1997.
- . *Dionysus Reborn: Play and the Aesthetic Dimension in Modern Philosophical and Scientific Discourse*. Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1989.
- . Eds. *The Play of the Self*. Buffalo: SUNY, 1984.
- . Ed. *Mimesis in Contemporary Theory: An Interdisciplinary Approach*. Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 1984.
- Stanford, Ann Folwell. "'Human Debris': Border Politics, Body Parts, and Reclamation of the Americas in Leslie Marmon Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *Literature and Medicine* 16.1 (1997): 23-42.
- Taussig, Michael. *Mimesis and Alterity: A Particular History of the Senses*. New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Trouillot, Michel-Rolph. "Anthropology and the Savage Slot: The Poetics and Politics of Otherness." *Fox* 17-44.
- Van Dyke, Annette. "From Big Green Fly to the Stone Serpent: Following the Dark Vision in Silko's *Almanac of the Dead*." *SAIL* 10.3 (Fall 1998): 34-45.
- Weaver, Jace. *That the People Might Live:*

*Native American Literatures and  
Native American Community.*  
Cambridge: Oxford UP, 1997.

張月珍。〈席爾柯作品中之神話與女性〉。《白沙評論》1.11 (1998): 61-73。

張錦忠。〈譯詩與卞雅民〉。《中外文學》29.1(2000): 80-85。

---。〈言本的傳譯性與譯人的天職〉。陳鵬翔與張靜二(編)。《從影響研究到中國文學》。台北:書林。139-53。  
單德興。〈反覆的環扣:訪伊哲談可譯性〉。《英美文學評論:第二期》2 (1995):197-211。